Review of Common Bloodstain Patterns Documented at a Crime Scene in the Event of Blunt Force Hit

Samir Kumar Bandyopadhyay* and Nabanita Basu

Department of Computer Science & Engineering, University of Calcutta, India

*Corresponding Email: <u>skb1@vsnl.com</u>

ABSTRACT

The scientific study/interpretation of bloodstain patterns at a crime scene, provide invaluable evidence for sequencing, reconstruction of events that might have occurred at the crime scene. As per the Federal Bureau of Investigation(FBI) each year a greater number of people die as a consequence of blunt force trauma compared to the number of people who are killed with a rifle or shot gun. From documentation phase to final interpretation, bloodstain pattern analysis is deeply rooted in the principles of physics, fluid mechanics, medical science, computer science, mathematics etc. This paper is largely aimed at reviewing the multidisciplinary work that has already been undertaken by scientists round the world to understand impact stain patterns, castoff, transfer and saturation stain patterns that are most commonly visible in a crime scene that involves blunt force injury. Again, like most other disciplines of forensic science, the reliability and error rates associated with the interpretation of bloodstain patterns still stands questionable. Inspired by the work that has been undertaken in the field of fluid mechanics, medical science, computer science, mathematics, physics etc., the authors have tried to amalgamate the works that have particularly contributed towards scientific advancement in the documentation, interpretation of bloodstain patterns, thereby putting forth the research initiative that they (i.e. the authors) intend to undertake within the multidisciplinary domain of bloodstain pattern analysis.

Keywords: Transfer stain, Cast-off pattern, Impact spatter, Saturation stain, Bloodstain pattern analysis, Fluid mechanics.

INTRODUCTION

Locard's exchange principle states that "every time an individual makes contact with another person, place or thing, it results in an exchange of physical materials"¹. The study of evidence at a crime scene is particularly based on this principle. Bloodstain pattern analysis is defined as 'the scientific study of the static consequences resulting from dynamic blood shedding events'². The detailed study of bloodstain patterns obtained from a crime scene could prove to be invaluable evidence for part/full crime scene reconstruction, in testing the credibility of the statements of the victim,

suspect, bystander/evewitness (if any). As per the International Association of Bloodstain Pattern Analysts (IABPA), a bloodstain pattern is defined as 'a grouping or distribution of bloodstains that indicate through regular or repetitive form, order, or arrangement the manner in which the pattern was deposited'³. Based on the different case studies presented at the IABPA conference⁴ the authors are of the view that of the different types of bloodstain patterns, the most common stain patterns visible at the crime scene, particularly in the case where the victim was found to suffer blunt force injuries, are saturation, impact, cast off and transfer stain patterns.

Violent criminal activities under most circumstances are accompanied by large spillage of blood. A bloodstain formed due to accumulation of liquid blood on an absorbent surface such as carpet, fabric, clothing, bed sheet, curtains etc. is commonly referred to as 'Saturation Stain'³. Large amount of blood outflow occurs when a person suffers serious head injuries owing to hammer strike or when struck on the head with a blunt ended object, such as a golf stick, candle stand, sticks etc. Under such circumstance one could evidently expect to see stained carpets, clothes etc. depending on the position of the victim, perpetrator and bystander (if any). Again, as a result of the impact mechanism or rather the impact force of hit, certain stain patterns are developed. Because these stain patterns are developed as a result of an object striking liquid blood, these are commonly known as 'Impact Pattern'³. Bloodstain patterns formed as a result of contact between a blood-bearing surface and another surface is commonly referred to as Transfer Stains by the IABPA³. Blood bearing fingers, bloody weapons, half bloody or bloody shoes etc. leave transfer stains in a crime scene as a result of the sequence of events that had occurred at the crime scene. Thus Transfer

stains in coherence with other bloodstain patterns such as Voids, Saturation Stain, Cast-off patterns etc. can be effectively used for part/full reconstruction of crime scene.

The authors conducting the study are particularly interested in recording, analysis and interpretation of the Transfer Stain and Saturation Stain patterns one can expect to see in the event of head hit by a blunt ended object (such as hammer, golf stick, candle stand etc.). This work is in itself a review of the work that has been undertaken in terms of case based study of stains together with the scientific explanations of the mechanisms that lead to the formation of the stains

Section 1 (Introduction) introduces the reader/s to the basic content of this paper. Section 2 (Background) gives a brief overview of the different case study's relevant to the aforementioned stain patterns together with the physical mechanisms that seemingly lead to the formation of the stain patterns. This section particularly justifies the study and interpretation of transfer stain patterns and saturation stain patterns and how such knowledge could have effectively been used for part reconstruction of crime scene. Section 3 (Knowledge Base) outlines the facts that have already been published in the bloodstain pattern scientific literature. Section 4 (Controversies) is largely devoted to identifying areas within the domain of Transfer and Saturation stain patterns that require further investigation. The next Section 5 (Suggestions/Future section. work) clearly outlines the areas in which research activities could particularly be undertaken within the Transfer and Saturation stain domain in particular. Section 6 (Conclusion) deals with an assimilation of the works so far done, statements that need further investigation and suggests possible ways of working towards finding suitable answers.

BACKGROUND

In the IABPA Conference held in Arizona, 2004, Peter Lamb Tucson, presented the investigation report of the late night assault of a young man who was intoxicated at the time of attack and could only recollect part of the savagery that he had been subjected to⁵. Due to rain drop that had soaked the garment at the time of the assault it was difficult to examine the bloodstains on the soaked garment⁵. However there was evidence of kicking and stomping⁵. Based on the evidence the case finally proceeded for trial and the accused was proved guilty and hence imprisoned⁵. In his review of the Windsor city homicide case Scott Lamont pointed out that barefoot transfer impressions and footwear transfer impressions were found on the floor⁶. Foot morphology confirmed that the prints were left by the suspect who was wearing boots⁶. In the words of Lee Ann Singley, in the murder case of 2 women (74 year old mother and her 48 year old daughter) in their holiday home in small а town in Pennsylvania, while DNA evidence 'who?' answered in identifying the perpetrator at the trial, the bloodstain pattern evidence proved to be valuable to the jury in answering the 'how?'⁷. To add to the list, in the case of Regina vs. Sion Jenkins, expirated and other bloodstains on clothing were used as relevant evidence within the legal setting to acquit Sion Jenkins of the murder of his 13 year old daughter Billie Jo^8 . In the case presented by Paul Treudson, at a particular crime scene bloody transfer impressions of an apparent right hand holding a knife was found on top of a sheet that lay at the foot of the bed⁹. The impressions included knuckles and a blade⁹. As Erin Sims puts it, for one particular case the evidence particularly the bloodstain pattern evidence was the only honest teller of the course of events that had led to the victim'sinjury¹⁰.

Again, as per the Federal Bureau of Investigation (FBI) Chart reports each year more people are killed by hammer, club or blunt ended object hit as compared to the number of people killed wt rifle or shotgun¹¹. In this respect it might be interesting to mention that, in a case reviewed by Stuart H. James at the 2008 IABPA Annual Training conference, he reiterated that bodies of 4 Mexican construction workers were found in a rented apartment at Ohio¹². The bodies of the victims remained undiscovered for almost a week¹². When examined the victims were found to have suffered blunt and sharp force injuries¹². The highlight of the case review were the interesting bloodstain patterns found at the crime scene which were studied in conjunction with the wounds suffered/sustained by the victims¹². In their study, the authors came across many such cases where victims suffered blunt force injuries. Given the large possibility of instruments that can be easily obtained and hence deliver blunt force injuries to the human skull, the authors decided to particularly focus on the possible Transfer and Saturation stain patterns formed at a crime scene as a result of assault particularly with blunt ended objects.

Thus in a violent crime scene with sufficient amount of bloodshed, bloodstain pattern analysis often plays a significant role in proving or refuting the statements of the suspect, victim, bystander/eyewitness(if any) within the juridical setting. The stains along with the wound suffered by the victim/s could also be used for part/full reconstruction of crime scenes. These case studies particularly set out the background for this review paper.

Knowledge Base

Detection and documentation of stains at a crime scene

When it comes to documenting Bloodstain Patterns based o visibility of patterns to the naked eye there are in types particular 2 of bloodstain patterns/prints one could come across in real life - latent bloodstain patterns and visible Bloodstain Patterns. Given the fragile nature of bloodstain patterns at a crime scene, stains are often accompanied by noise or are superimposed by other stains in course of subsequent events at the crime scene. Luminol and Bluestar have often been used to detect latent or washed bloodstains that have been a challenge for forensic investigators. Thomas W. Adair and Rebecca L. Shaw highlight that irrespective of which reagent is used to visualize latent bloodstains, analysts should use caution when interpreting diffused or diluted bloodstain patterns occurring over a large area of the clothing under examination 13 . This is because the level of saturation may be the result of the washing process and hence may not relate to any specific event¹³. The bloodletting research undertaken by Adair and Shaw supports the use of Luminol as an effective reagent to visualize latent bloodstain patterns on washed clothing¹³. Though Leuco Crystal Violet was found to be an effective blood reagent on many washed and unwashed surfaces, the results that Adair et al. obtained in his study with use of LCV wasn't particularly impressive¹³. James O. Pex clearly outlined with evidential proof that Luminol does not confirm the presence of blood, hence it cannot be used to evaluate latent impact bloodstain patterns¹⁴. De Wael et al in his research document 'In search of blood detection of minute particles using Spectroscopic methods' devised and put forth an examination protocol for rapid detection of remnants of blood particles on

garments of suspects in bloody murder cases¹⁵. Infrared Digital Imaging (IR), Ultraviolet Digital Imaging (UV), Reflected Ultraviolet Digital Imaging and Hemascein (a fluroscein based material) are some applications that can be used for locating and enhancing bloodstains that are particularly latent or faint to the unaided human eye¹⁶. The study undertaken C. Middle stead and J. Thornton showed that Luminol tests can be unambiguously interpreted at substantially greater dilutions of blood¹⁷. The sensitivity of the luminol test was performed on denim fabric¹⁷. Tontarski *et al.* worked on the chemical enhancement techniques that could be used for making latent bloodstain patterns visible to the unaided eye¹⁸.

By way of experience, an individual can clearly understand the difficulty of visualizing bloodstain patterns on dark colored fabric. The study undertaken by Ted Silenieks, Russell Cook, Kareana Turner and Jose Nunn used hyper-spectral imaging to assess the contrast between bloodstains and different dark colored fabrics at defined wavelengths over the visible and near infrared range¹⁹. By way of this study Silenieks et al examined the use of appropriate light sources, contrast enhancement techniques, the reliability of near infrared detection of bloodstains and the limitations in bloodstain pattern recognition¹⁹. Gorn and James are of the opinion that Infrared Photography has primarily been used for documentation of gunshot residue patterns and bloodstain patterns on dark colored clothing²⁰. As per Gorn and James, in comparison to other techniques in use this technique is particularly non-destructive in nature²⁰. The fact that this technique does not interfere with serological/DNA testing and is relatively simple to use, makes this technique a technique of choice among most analyst²⁰. In 2008, Elizabeth van Zanten and

Rob Spruit initiated a near infrared imaging project at the crime scene unit of the regional police force Middle en West Brabact in the Netherlands²¹. The main objective of the project was to evaluate near infrared imaging as an additional forensic tool for the visualization of blood on dark surfaces²¹. As per Zanten *et al* for detection of latent blood on dark porous surface/ material near-Infrared photography has proven to be an excellent non destructive alternative as compared to other chemical blood enhancement techniques in place²¹.

There are three basic crime scenes/environments from which or in which an analyst needs to study/interpret bloodstain patterns and hence reconstruct the crime scene²². They are - Active Scenes, Released Scenes and Cold Scenes²². Figure 1²² provides an overview of the different types of crime scenes that an analyst might have to work in. (See figure1.)

Given that in case of a released or cold scene the only bloodstain pattern evidence that an analyst could have access to proper, effective documentation of the bloodstain pattern at the crime scene stands integral. Tom and Gardener outlined basic guidelines for photograph based documentation of bloodstain patterns at a crime scene in the chapter 'Documenting Bloodstains' of the book titled, 'Bloodstain Pattern Analysis: An introduction to crime scene reconstruction²². Based on the old adage, "a picture is worth a thousand words", R. Daniel Winterich presented a methodical technique for documenting bloodstain patterns at the crime scene²³. Herbert Leon Mac Donell rightly pointed out that photographs cannot allow depth perception whereas models demonstrate this perception quite well²⁴. Hence, 3D modeling of the crime scene and intervention of 'live' persons is particularly important in understanding and hence scientifically justifying what happened and what could not

probably have happened²⁴. Mijntje Arts explains that before clothing or any other items from the crime scene are analyzed or examined for bloodstain pattern analysis, it is important that the information received from the case documentation is preassessed²⁵. Mijntje believes that preassessments of scene prior to evidence interpretation, increases the chance for the results of the bloodstain pattern analysis being particularly focused and hence unbiased²⁵. Delft Tech provides support for 3D blood Spatter Analysis and Virtual Crime Scene Reconstruction²⁶. Dr. M. Taylor did a systematic study of some of the common bloodstain patterns using a high speed video camera to record the blood transfer as it occurred 27,28 . He developed a database of 500 digital video clips of common bloodletting events²⁸.

Scientific basis of interpretation of the stains

As suggested by many forensic analysts, bloodstain pattern analysis is not particularly a new discipline in itself. The roots of bloodstain pattern analysis as forensics know it in the modern day world dates back to the 1800s²⁹. To understand the different stain patterns (particularly Transfer Stain and Saturation Stain Patterns in this case) it is indeed important to have a clear understanding of the physical mechanism and scientific principles that control the fall, spattering of blood at the crime scene. Forces of cohesion, adhesion, gravitation, surface tension primarily control the formation of bloodstain patterns at a crime scene. The document put together by the University of Western Australia on Blood Spatter³⁰ and Dr. J.J. Nordby's 'Basic Bloodstain Pattern analysis Text³¹ give a precise vet lucid description of the different forces that control the formation of the different bloodstain patterns in a crime scene. To add to this, Ed Bernstein in his article published in the Journal of Bloodstain

Pattern Analysis, December 2005. highlighted the science that governs the formation of bloodstain patterns at a crime scene³². These papers describe how the forces of adhesion, cohesion, gravitation and surface tension act in coherence with each other and hence control the shape of the formed³⁰⁻³². bloodstain pattern Mark Reynolds provided a stepwise description of the transition phases of a blood droplet to a bloodstain upon contact with a planar surface in an eloquent way thereby simplifying the complicated fluid dynamics involved³³. The study conducted by M.E. Reynolds, M.A. Raymond and I. Dadour shows that an apparent power law relationship may exist between the size of a parent blood droplet and the role of viscous and surface tension forces on subsequent bloodstain formation particularly for those bloodstains caused by small droplets impacting the planar surfaces obliquely 34 . Elizabeth Williams worked on 'the biomechanics of blunt force trauma'35. In order to accurately and quantitatively reconstruct the events at the scene of a blunt force trauma assault, she undertook a detailed study of the kinematic sequences and mechanisms involved in the striking action³⁵. She thereby developed a 3D biomechanical model for data analysis³⁵. Attinger et al did a comparative review of the literature on Bloodstain Pattern Analysis and Fluid Dynamics (FD) relating to 5 basic aspects, namely, the physical forces driving the motion of blood as a fluid; the generation of the drops; their flight in the air; their impact on solid or liquid surfaces; and the production of stains³⁶. Attinger *et al.* hence made suggestions on the probable areas of interdisciplinary research involving BPA and FD³⁶. The study by Ross Gardener shows that the variables of force and volume affect the resulting size of an impact spatter³⁷. As force increases there is a general decrease in spatter size. Again as

volume increases there is a general increase in spatter size³⁷. The study therefore suggests that spatter size is not a specific predictor of force or mechanism in a crime scene³⁷. Impact spatter stains are again quite common in a crime scene where a victim has suffered blunt force trauma. Young II Seo performed a comparative study of the velocities of swinging hammer and how it affects the formation of blood spatters using a high speed camera³⁸. He documented that when the average velocity of a hammer swung with all the experimenter's strength at a pool of blood was recorded to be about 12.5 m/sec, the average velocity of impact spatter that was generated by the swinging hammer was found to be 52 m/sec^{38} . By way of experimentation, the velocity of the swing cast off spatter that was generated was found to be 4.7 times the velocity at which the hammer was swung by the experimenter and again it was found to be 3.9 times faster than the expectorate spatter that was generated by emitting blood from the mouth with all the strength³⁸. experimenter's Strikingly however, the velocities of cast off spatter and expectorate spatter showed similar distributions³⁸.

To study or rather interpret impact spatter stains proper selection of regular geometric stains in an impact spatter is particularly important for calculation of the area of origin of the impact that created the particular spatter stain. Illes *et al.* presented a set of criteria for selection of patterns in an impact spatter using a statistical model³⁹. Shen, Brostow, Cipolla developed an algorithm for automated estimation of a body's 2D location on a floor plan when the body is impacted given that the blood stains are formed as a result of impact spatter⁴⁰. In order to improve the estimation of the point of origin, it is important to select bloodstains that lie close to the presumable location of the blood source. Individual stains that are large (width > 1.5 mm) and that which have

an elliptical form should be selected⁴⁰. As per K. G. de Bruin *et al*, bloodstains from different walls should be taken into account in order to improve the methodology to determine the point of origin of a particular impact spatter in consideration⁴¹. Experiments undertaken by Behrooz *et al* showed that some error stands inherent in the process of blood disintegration but this does not greatly affect the calculation of the area of origin as per known scientific methods⁴².

As per Karger, Rand, Fracasso and Pfeiffer, the morphology of bloodstain distribution patterns at the crime scene carries vital information for reconstruction of the events that occurred at a crime scene⁴³. Norman Reeves did an initial study of the sequencing of multiple bloodstain patterns that were present at a crime scene⁴⁴. He examined blind samples to determine if there were re-occurring indicators when looking for a layered blood staining that could be used when conducting an analysis⁴⁴. One often comes across angled surfaces in real life. Carter et al. designed experiments to compare and contrast bloodstain spatters formed on angled surfaces with spatters formed on flat surfaces⁴⁵. Joseph A. Slemko in his work particularly looked at the effect of droplet velocity and fabric composition on bloodstain patterns⁴⁶. In his work he experimentally compared bloodstain patterns created on a collection of various fabrics based upon fabric composition, fabric texture, new vs. used/worn out fabrics, and chemically treated fabrics⁴⁶. Within the experimental design, a collection of various fabrics placed at different distances were exposed to blood droplets generated by a high speed fan⁴⁶. The droplets were hence compared on the basis of bloodstain size versus distance travelled in relation to fabric composition and chemical treatment of fabric⁴⁶. Based on the

experimental results. Slemko concluded that the degree of distortion of bloodstain observed on the fabric is a function of both. the ability of the fabric to absorb blood and the texture of the fabric 46 . However owing to the distorted nature of the bloodstain on fabric, interpretation of the impact angle often becomes difficult⁴⁶. F. Adolf put in place the guidelines that should be abided by when examining textile fiber/s within the Forensic context⁴⁷. B. Karger *et* al developed an experimental setting to evidentially highlight the differences between contact/transfer stains and projected droplet patterns on fabric surface⁴⁸. It was found that even on similar surfaces contact stain patterns lack the characteristic features of dynamic stains (i.e. projected droplet stains)⁴⁸. However mode of formation of micro-stains on rough surface structure when the blood volume is small (< 1microlitre) is difficult to predict as the characteristic features of dynamic stains in case of such micro-stains are reduced⁴⁸. Tronnberg et al worked on and thereby provided essential guidelines for recognition of expirated bloodstain pattern on cotton fabrics⁴⁹. There have also been other works done documenting the recognition of expirated stain patterns on different fabrics⁵⁰. White summed up the effect of droplet volume, dropping height and impact volume on the bloodstain formed on a fabric⁵¹. It might surprise the readers to know that one could for a matter of fact come across a regular stain being formed on apparently porous fabric surface an depending on the volume of blood in the droplet and the location at which the droplet falls (refer Figure 2)⁵¹.

Higher velocity blood droplets again may produce satellite spatter upon impact with the cloth surface⁴⁶. The satellite spatter appearance in its turn is also dependent on the blood droplet volume⁵¹. Washing as also Scotchgard type fabric treatments directly

affect bloodstain pattern appearance 46 . Hence these effects must be taken into account when interpreting bloodstain patterns on fabric^{46,51}. Wound analysis is often done, in order to trace out the murder weapon that has been used by the perpetrator to cause injury to the victim. Given that the authors intend to study bloodstains commonly produced in the event of a head hit by a blunt ended object particularly hammer, hence it would be relevant to mention that when the head of an individual is forcefully hit with a blunt ended object with an intention to cause injury, not all areas of the skull show similar deformation⁵². Hence Rex Spark's study on wound analysis and how the wound pattern correlates to the accompanying bloodstain patterns is indeed relevant for this study⁵³. If a living human being is struck by a blunt ended weapon (namely say hammer), one could very well expect the living being to move when struck. This dynamic aspect of a person being hit by an object was first recognized by Dr. Pitrowski⁵⁴. He hit live rabbits on the head with a claw hammer at various angles or rather at all possible angles in order to record their movement when hit by a blunt ended object (eg. Hammer) on the head⁵⁴.

Mike Barnes designed an experiment to test how the variables such as cloth type, weapon type, impact force, target surface relative hardness affect the pattern of the transfer stain⁵⁵. To justify that these factors have noticeable effects in bloodstain formation he provided certain real time case facts alongside experimental results⁵⁵. Peter D. Barnett presented a case study to show how the bloody fingerprint transfer stain pattern could be effectively used for refuting or proving the statement of the defendant within a legal setting⁵⁶. As Barnett puts it, "In this particular case, the problem was not whether the fingerprint was made with wet blood or not, but whether the wet blood

could have been obtained when the defendant revisited the scene or only earlier"⁵⁶. The police investigators misconstrued the problem⁵⁶. As per expert testimony, the bloody fingerprint marks could not have been deposited in a way that was described by the defendant⁵⁶. Rob Bone in his work highlighted how the analysis of fingerprint/palmprint transfer stains at a crime scene could aid the overall process of crime scene reconstruction⁵⁷. By analyzing the fingerprint mark an analyst would be able to determine if the finger/palm was wet with blood when it came in contact with the object, whether the clean finger had come in contact with blood already present on object or if blood had come into contact with an existing finger/palm mark on the object⁵⁷. Experiments devised by Huss et al clearly aided understanding of the mechanism involved in the creation of a fingerprint pattern in blood⁵⁸. As per the distinguished British analyst, Frederick Wood Jones, the human feet are the most distinct part of his anatomical makeup⁵⁹. Thomas W. Adair experimented with several casting materials on red colored concrete, fabric and human skin which are particularly known as difficult surfaces for interpretation of stain patterns, in order to transfer bloody shoe impressions onto a medium which offers better contrast for general photography⁶⁰.

Drying and clotting of blood

Although regionally extreme temperature were found to make the drying time of blood vary, the project undertaken by Brady *et al.* clearly showed that temperature does not affect the overall characteristics of bloodstain patterns⁶¹. Zeid *et al* demonstrated the ways in which relative humidity affects the drying time and also the blood stain pattern formation⁶². Relative Humidity influences the contact angle, the final wetting diameter together with the final deposition pattern at the end of

Hemospat⁷² are popular toolkits that are

the evaporation $process^{62}$. Laber *et al.* demonstrated the effect of substrate on the drying time of blood⁶³. In the IABPA conference held in Atlantic City, New Jersey on October, 2010, Dr. Silke Brod beck discussed the basic principles of the human blood coagulation system and its relevance in the field of bloodstain pattern analysis⁶⁴. In the review of Shirley McGill's murder case, Stuart H. James emphasized the significance of clotted bloodstain pattern evidence on the clothing of Robert McGill that was in all likelihood produced as a combination of impact and expirated blood⁶⁵. By experimentation, F. Nour-Eldin et al. determined the nature of blood clotting factors in the saliva of normal patients and of patients with haemophilia or Christmas disease⁶⁶. Berckmann et al. proved by experimentation that the saliva-induced shortening of the clotting time of whole blood for healthy subject was dependent on the tissue factor⁶⁷. Snake venom accelerates blood coagulation. Human saliva accelerates the prothrombin time as much as it gets accelerated by snake venom⁶⁷. Thereby H.K. P.H. Doo and Lee undertook an investigation to identify the nature of these acceleration factors and how they interrelate to other factors that accelerate the process of blood coagulation⁶⁸.

Digital aid in interpretation of bloodstain patterns

In the research project undertaken by A.L. Carter, Rachel Collins, Serge Larocque and Brian Yamashita, blood was spattered on a combination of flat and angled walls The bloodstain patterns were first analyzed using the stringing method and then the data was subsequently entered into the modified Back Track program to demonstrate that the new version of the Back Track program could also handle angled surfaces⁶⁹. In this regard it might be interesting for the readers Back Track^{70,71} know that and to

used for manual yet partly computer assisted analysis of bloodstain patterns obtained at a crime scene. Though widely used, yet these toolkits require the intervention of an experienced bloodstain pattern analysis to determine parameters of input and hence interpret results. Carter et al devised a methodology for documentation and hence interpretation of bloodstain patterns at a crime scene using a video camera and a computer⁷³. In 1999, Andrew Fitzgibbon *et* al suggested an efficient methodology for least square fitting of ellipses to scattered data⁷⁴. This method could very well be used to fit ellipses to individual spatter stains in an impact spatter⁷⁴. Sergeant Mark Reynolds in his presentation at the October, 2008, IABPA conference described an innovative and improved alternative to current manual bloodstain measurement methods using Microsoft Office Excel, 2003 Auto shape function that allows for the on-scene computer assisted fitting of theoretical ellipses to regular bloodstains for measurement purposes⁷⁵. Mathew Noedel demonstrated a technique to use Adobe Photoshop to measure and document the length and width ratios of individual regular bloodstains⁷⁶. He also demonstrated additional procedures to use features in Photoshop to manipulate multiple images to produce the same approximate scale and methods to extract useful information from digital images taken with poor lightning and contrast⁷⁶. Michael Taylor designed explore the dvnamics experiments to involved in the creation of a cast off pattern with the aim to enhance the importance of the input provided by a BPA analyst within a crime scene investigation team⁷⁷. Dr. Silke Brod beck described how anatomy related movement analysis (ARMA) could effectively be used as a tool for reconstruction of body movements in the creation of transfer stain patterns⁷⁸. The

presentation focused on how ARMA combines practical knowledge of BPA and functional anatomy at predicting body movements that could lead to the formation of a particular transfer stain⁷⁸. Detective Kevin Maloney presented 3D representation of Bloodstain Pattern Analysis bv integrating data from Back Track into a standard AutoCAD program in order to represent the virtual flight paths of blood droplets in a 3D space⁷⁹. As put forward by Philippe Esperanca, eSCrime is a software package that helps investigators locate in a crime scene the computed origin of the examined bloodstains⁸⁰. As the software allows modeling of the crime scene, hence it stands easy for investigators to study the 3D virtual origin within modeled а environment⁸⁰.

Presentation as evidence within a juridical setting

In 1955, Dr. Paul Kirk first presented a bloodstain evidence affidavit in State of Ohio v Samuel Sheppard^{81,82}. Thereafter, expert testimony in bloodstain pattern interpretation gained widespread acceptance with the US legal framework. Kirk's contribution to the study of bloodstain pattern evidence within the legal framework is indeed commendable⁸³. Bart Epstein felt that the Indiana v David Camm case was particularly significant because of the concerns it triggered with respect to admissibility of bloodstain pattern evidence in the court room⁸⁴. The major concerns the case raised for bloodstain pattern analysis practitioners can be summarized as follows-1) the qualification of individuals presenting bloodstain pattern evidence within a legal setting, 2) associated error rates, 3) validation studies and 4) the need to know science as it relates to Bloodstain Pattern Analysis⁸⁴. Given the critical role bloodstain pattern analysis often plays in violent crime reconstruction. Louis scene L. Akin

prepared a document that could provide legal practitioner a basic understanding of the principles and procedures of bloodstain spatter analysis thereby allowing the defense attorney to hold an intelligent conversation with the defense bloodstain spatter analyst or cross-examine the prosecution's expert pattern analyst on the bloodstain evidence together with the evidence drawn up⁸⁵. On similar lines the book on Scientific and Legal Applications of Bloodstain Pattern Analysis discusses research, applications and the current status of bloodstain pattern interpretation within the legal system at the trial and appellate level courts⁸⁶. By outlining on the scientific approaches and developments in the field of bloodstain pattern analysis this book is particularly aimed at equipping legal professionals with the basic working knowledge of BPA required to present as also cross examine bloodstain pattern evidence within the juridical system⁸⁶. The paper 'Legal and Ethical Aspects of Bloodstain Pattern Evidence 'by Carl Henderson and Brittan Mitchell clearly represented the issues of bloodstain evidence admissibility, weight of bloodstain pattern evidence, required qualification of an expert bloodstain pattern analyst to present or question such evidence in the court of law⁸⁷. Apart from the methods of presentation of expert testimony and cross examination of evidence, the paper also discusses the ethical issues of the attorney and the expert witness called in $court^{87}$. 'Topics to consider in Preparation for an Admissibility Hearing on Bloodstain Pattern Analysis' by the Scientific Working Bloodstain Group on Pattern Analysis(SWGSTAIN) is an official resource for preparation of admissibility hearing on the topic of bloodstain pattern analysis in the courtroom⁸⁸. On June 28, 1993, the U.S. Supreme court's landmark decision on Daubert v Merrell Dow Pharmaceuticals, Inc. finally resolved the twentieth century

debate on the admissibility of scientific evidence in the court of law thereby taking to more enduring admissibility standard that would accept the use scientific evidence for technical issues but would at the same time protect the jury from being unduly persuaded by swindlers who proclaim themselves as experts⁸⁹. On the flip side based on the qualifications of the expert witness and when there is a lack of scientific basis for presentation of bloodstain evidence in the court or when the court feels the evidence has been contaminated in some way, the court might very well treat such inadmissible⁹⁰. evidence as

CONTROVERSIES

In the book 'Bloodstain Pattern Analysis-an introduction to Crime Scene Reconstruction' Bevel and Gardener had introduced a bloodstain pattern classification system that deviates from the terminology and classification system followed by the IABPA²². In the review of the book, Dr. R. R. Ristenbatt III clearly mentions that a new terminology as also bloodstain pattern classification system based on taxonomy was totally unnecessary. Again the book describes surface tension as the "force holding the blood mass to the object", which is particularly incorrect. Though an informative read, some of the concepts highlighted in the book are highly debatable⁹¹. The stain pattern classification system put in place by Stuart H. James is however well accepted within the community of bloodstain pattern analysts⁹².

For micro stains having a volume of less than 1 micro-liter it is often difficult to predict the physical mechanism that has led to the formation of the particular stain pattern⁴⁸. Again, on similar lines it has been proved by various experiments undertaken that bloodstain patterns cannot be particularly classified on the basis of

velocity of impact alone. In the IABPA conference held in October, 2004 Herbert Leon MacDonell showed several patterns that are similar in appearance to high velocity impact spatter, but in fact are not. He thereby concluded by mentioning that it is actually impossible to say anything from a bloodstain pattern more than that the pattern is consistent with and therefore could have been produced as a result of high velocity impact on a blood source⁹³. Again, to add to this, the study undertaken by Young II Seo highlight that expectorate spatter stain as also cast-off spatter stain having different velocities were found to create similar distribution patterns³⁸.

As is quite evident from Section 3.2, substantial work regarding the behavior of blood on varying fabric surfaces has been undertaken^{46-51,94}. The effect of saliva on blood coagulation on fabric surface has also been widely studied⁶⁶⁻⁶⁸. But questions as to how blood reacts to sweat on fabric, does pattern distribution change on fabrics due to sweat formation - still remain unanswered. From study conducted by J.A. Slemko it can be safely concluded that pattern formation on worn out, washed fabric is distinctly different as compared to pattern formation on new fabric⁴⁶.

Like most other disciplines in science, forensic science and particularly bloodstain pattern analysis is also affected by bias. Bias related to bloodstain pattern analysis can particularly be classified under two broad heads⁹⁵. They are context bias and confirmation bias⁹⁵. Figure-2⁹⁵ represents the different types of biases that plague bloodstain pattern analysis. (See figure 2)

Though validation tests, blind folded studies, evidence interpretation by qualified experienced professional have been suggested yet the associated error rates, the magnitude of the problem and how often or how readily it plagues the interpretation made my eminent bloodstain pattern analysts still remain debatable.

SUGGESTIONS / FUTURE WORK / DISCUSSION

From the information provided in the previous sections of the document, one can very well conclude that bloodstain pattern analysis is indeed an interdisciplinary study area that has generous contribution from fields of mechanics, physics, mathematics, computer science, chemistry and medical science. Substantial work has been done with relevance to the target surface and how it affects the formation of bloodstain patterns. But there still remain certain loopholes as mentioned in Section 4 (Controversies). From research conducted, it can be safely concluded that presence of water, saliva do affect the formation of stain pattern on clothing. However, an interesting aspect that the authors would want to investigate how sweat on worn clothes affect bloodstain patterns on different types of fabrics. On a more precise note, does sweat affect stains formed on fabric, if at all it does, what are the basic differences that it induces into the pattern?

On a similar note, commendable work has been done for locating and hence enhancing bloodstain patterns on difficult surfaces. Difficult surfaces in this context include dark colored surfaces, human skin, fabrics etc^{19-21,60}. Though there are toolkits in place to enhance bloodstain patterns on dark colored surfaces, the authors would like to build a fully automated tool that can enhance bloodstain patterns on difficult surfaces using various image processing techniques. As of date, Infrared as also Near Infrared Photography is considered as a non-destructive convenient. useful, methodology for recording latent bloodstain patterns as it does not interfere with subsequent DNA or serology test¹⁹⁻²¹. The automated software that the authors intend

to build shall take as input digital as also infrared images and be able to automatically trace out bloodstain patterns thereby improving the toolkits in use for locating and enhancement of bloodstain patterns, visible or latent, on all types of difficult surfaces.

Work has been undertaken with respect to blunt force trauma and the stains that accompany blunt force hit^{35,54}. Moving a step further, the authors intend to recreate blunt force hit crime scenes with due reference to literature and case studies. The authors believe that creating such a database shall help them correlate the stains in the crime scene to the stains on the clothing of individuals present at the crime scene. Being computer science professionals, the authors aim to use semi supervised learning and bloodstain patterns on techniques clothing and in the surroundings as features to provide probabilistic prediction the of the positions victim, perpetrator, bystander/eyewitness (if any), thereby inducing more objectivity into the study and interpretation of bloodstain patterns using statistical methods.

The authors also plan to estimate the different types of biases involved in the interpretation of bloodstain patterns in the event of blunt force head hit at a crime scene. By asking law enforcement bloodstain pattern analysts to interpret the recreated crime scenes the authors intend to work out the different sort of biases that experienced as also inexperienced law enforcement officials and analysts often fall prey to.

The future research objectives that have been outlined by the authors are in coherence with the research needs/objects outlined by the Scientific Working Group of Bloodstain Pattern Analysts (SWGSTAIN)⁹⁶.

CONCLUSION

The research work on BPA in its very core is based on the age old Biblical dictum "Blood never lies". The authors believe that the multidisciplinary nature of bloodstain pattern analysis is what truly makes this domain of study lucrative and indeed interesting. The fact that blood follows the laws of fluid mechanics and reacts similarly under similar physical conditions forms the basis of bloodstain pattern analysis. From the literature and from case study experience the authors conclude that the basic most common bloodstain patterns that an individual can expect to see when an individual is hit by a blunt ended object are- transfer stain patterns from fingers, weapon, saturation stain patterns, impact spatter, cast off pattern and even expirated stain patterns on certain occasions. These can be accompanied by drip trail patterns, flow, wipe and swipe patterns as well. But this work is particularly focused at studying the most common pattern stain associated with blunt force hit. From literature review it can be safely concluded that various surfaces, concrete, fabric react differently to bloodstain dropped by similar physical mechanisms. There also exist intra- surface differences that impact or rather influence the formation of bloodstain pattern formation. For example, fabrics based on texture, porosity, absorbing power impact the formation of the bloodstain pattern. Again, study shows volume of blood, impact force as also fall height have significant effect on bloodstain pattern formation.

Proper documentation of crime scene is the first step towards accurate interpretation, reconstruction and hence presentation of bloodstain pattern evidence within a legal setting. Guidelines for proper documentation of crime scene bloodstain pattern are well laid out in the book 'Bloodstain Pattern Analysis-an introduction to crime scene reconstruction (3rd. edition)' by Bevel and Gardener. A well accepted classification of bloodstain patterns based particularly on the mechanism of formation of the bloodstain patterns have been put forward by Stuart H. James. Work on the fluid dynamics of bloodstain patterns have been well reviewed by Daniel Attinger.

Owing to case studies put forward by Peter D. Barnett, Charlie Marie, Scott Lament, one could very well infer the critical role that foot, finger, palm and weapon transfer stains play in crime scene reconstruction. Again wound analysis helps the study of bloodstain patterns thereby helping the analyst in drawing up inferences relative to the type of tool that had been used to cast the wound.

There are well drawn up methodologies in place for directional analysis, location of the area of origin of an impact spatter in a crime scene. Tools like Back Track and Hemospat have truly aided the rigorous manual process of bloodstain pattern interpretation that was undertaken by analysts in previous times.3D virtual representation of a crime scene adds to the suite of technical support that is available to crime scene analysts.

Dr. Pitrowski's experiment involving live rabbits to record the movements of a victim when it suffers blunt force trauma, is of particular interest to the authors. In order to fill in the gaps within the literature on bloodstain pattern analysis, the authors intend to build a system that could correlate the bloodstains on the clothing of the individuals to other bloodstains at the crime scene, based on which it could thereby make probabilistic predictions on the positions of the victim, perpetrator, bystander/ eyewitness (if any). The authors believe that such a system would add objectivity to the inference that could be drawn about the position of individuals in a crime scene together with predicting their role in the

same. As per the FBI chart report, each year more people are killed by blunt force hit as compared to the number of people killed by rifle or shot gun. Therefore, at the very onset the authors would like to focus on study and re-creation of criminal events involving blunt force hit. In due course of time this work can be extended to bloodletting events involving knife, rifle and shotgun respectively.

REFERENCES

- Welding, S. (2012, 12). Locard's Exchange Principle - Forensic HandbookForensic Handbook. Retrieved October 22, 2014, from http://www.forensichandbook.com/locardsexchange-principle/.
- 2. Nordby, J. J. (2006). Final Analysis Forensics. Retrieved from http://www. finalanalysisforensics.com/media/pdfs/Basic BloodstainPatternAnalysisTEXT.pdf.
- Scientific Working Group On Bloodstain Pattern Analysis. (2009, April). FBI — Standards and Guidelines - Scientific Working Group on Bloodstain Pattern Analysis: Recommended Terminology -April 2009. Retrieved from http://www. fbi.gov/about-us/lab/forensic-sciencecommunications/fsc/april2009/standards/200 9 04 standards01.htm.
- 4. http://www.iabpa.org/journal.
- 5. December News 2004, The Use of BPA Modeling in Investigations, Peter Lamb, Page 8.
- 6. December News 2004, City of Windsor Homicide Case, Scott Lamont, Page 11.
- December News 2006, We Got Our Man (in more ways than one), LeeAnn Singley, Page 23.
- 8. December News 2007, Regina v. Sion Jenkins, Joe Slemko, Page 8-9.
- 9. December News 2007, Case Presentation, Paul Treudson, Page 12.
- 10. December News 2008,Bloodstain Patterns Help Tell the Story When the Victim Can't... or Won't, Erin Sims Page 19.
- 11. Toplikar, D. (2010, December 13). Blood stain with hammer imprint shown in ex-FBI

agent's murder trial - Las Vegas Sun News. Retrieved from http://www.lasvegassun. com/news/2010/dec/13/blood-stain-showedimprint-hammer-says-analyst-ex-/.

- 12. December News 2008 Page 17.
- 13. December News 2005 Page 4.
- 14. December News 2005 Page 11.
- 15. http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/18706 777.
- 16. Abstracts of Papers Presented at the Annual IABPA Training Conference in Atlantic City, New Jersey, October 5-8, 2010, Page 23-24.
- Middlestead, C. and Thornton, J. Sensitivity of the Luminol Test with Blue Denim, *J. Forensic Sci.*, September 2010, Vol. 55, No. 5, pp. 1340-1342.
- 18. http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/19018 938.
- Abstracts of Presentations and Workshops Given at The 2011 IABPA Annual Training Conference in Milwaukee, Wisconsin, Page 14, Live Imaging of Bloodstains on Dark Fabric using near Infrared and a modified SLR Digital Camera.
- 20. Using Infrared Photography to Document Clothing Evidence in the Reconstruction of a Homicide, MichaelGorn and Stuart H. James,Page 3-9, December 2012 News.
- 21. Abstracts of Papers, Workshops and Posters Presented at the Fourth International IABPA Conference in Edinburgh, Scotland, November 12-14, 2012, Visualization of Blood and Near-Infrared Photography, Page 12-13.
- 22. Bevel, T., & Gardner, R. M. (2002). Bloodstain pattern analysis: With an introduction to crime scene reconstruction (3rd ed.).
- 23. http://www.forensicmag.com/articles/2009/1 0/documenting-bloodstain-patterns-throughroadmapping.
- 24. Abstracts of Papers Presented At the IABPA Annual Conference in Corning, New York, December 2006, Herbie's Angels, Herbert Leon MacDonell, Page 21-22.
- 25. BPA Examination on Clothing in Light of the 'Right' question '*MijntjeAarts-December 2012 News*, Abstracts of Papers, Workshops and Posters Presented at the Fourth International IABPA Conference in

Edinburgh, Scotland, November 12-14, 2012 Page 13.

- 26. http://delfttech.com/.
- 27. Abstracts of the Scientific Presentations given at the 2008 IABPA Annual Training Conference, Dec 2008, Highlights from the high-speed video project, Dr. Michael Taylor.
- 28. https://www.ameslab.gov/mfrc/bpa-videos.
- 29. MacDonell, H.L., Segments of History in the Documentation of Bloodstain Pattern Interpretation-Segment 01:1901-1910. International Association of Bloodstain Pattern Analysts News, 1992.8(4): p. 5-22.
- Centre for Learning Technology, University of Western Australia. (n.d.). Centre for Learning Technology. Retrieved October 17, 2014, from http://www.clt.uwa.edu.au/ __data/assets/pdf_file/0017/2301650/fsb05.p df.
- 31. Nordby, J. J. (2006). Final Analysis Forensics. Retrieved from http://www. finalanalysisforensics.com/media/pdfs/Basic BloodstainPatternAnalysisTEXT.pdf.
- 32. Science in Bloodstain pattern analysis, Page 16-19, JBPA December, 2005.
- Abstracts of Papers Presented at the Annual IABPA Training Conference in Atlantic City, New Jersey, October 5-8, 2010, Blood Droplet to Bloodstain : A Transition Process Paradox , Dr. Mark Reynolds, December, 2010, Page 22.
- Reynolds, M.E., Raymond, M.A., and Dadour, I. The Use of Small Bloodstains in Blood Source Area of Origin Determinations. *Can. Soc. Forensic Sci. J.* 2009; 42 (2): 133-146.
- 35. Abstracts of Presentations and Workshops given at the IABPA Training Conference, Dec. 2009, The Biomechanics of Blunt Force Trauma, Page 16.
- Attinger, D., *et al.*, Fluid dynamics topics in bloodstain pattern analysis: Comparative review and research opportunities. *Forensic Science International*, 2013.231(1–3): p. 375-396.
- 37. Volume, the Ignored Variable, Daniel Attinger, December 2009 News.
- Measurements and Comparisons of Velocities of Swinging Hammer and Blood Spatters Using a High-Speed Camera Young

IlSeo, Abstracts of Presentations and Workshops Given at The 2011 IABPA Annual Training Conference in Milwaukee, Wisconsin, Page 16-17.

- Illes, M., &Boue, M. (2011). Investigation of a Model for Stain Selection in Bloodstain Pattern Analysis. *Canadian Society of Forensic Science*, 44(1), 1-12.
- Shen, A. R., Brostow, G. J., &Cipolla, R. (0). TOWARD AUTOMATIC BLOOD SPATTER ANALYSIS IN CRIME SCENES. Retrieved from http://mi.eng.cam. ac.uk/research/projects/BloodSpatter/BloodS patter_ShenBrostow.pdf.
- 41. DeBruin, K. G., Stoel, R., D., Limborgh, J. and Josita, C.M., Improving the Point of Origin Determination in Bloodstain Pattern Analysis, *J. Forensic Sci.*, November, 2011, Vol. 56, No. 6.
- 42. Behrooz, N., Hulse-Smith, L. and Chandra, Sanjeev, An Evaluation of the Underlying Mechanisms of Bloodstain Pattern Analysis Error, *J. Forensic Sci.*, September, 2011, Vol. 56, No. 5.
- Karger, B., Rand, S., Fracasso, T., and Pfeiffer, H., Bloodstain Pattern Analysis – Casework Experience, *Forensic Science International*, Vol. 181, Issues 1-3, October 2008, pp. 15-20.
- 44. Study of Sequencing Bloodstain Layers, Norman Reeves, Abstracts of the Scientific Presentations given at the 2008 IABPA Annual Training Conference, Page 13.
- 45. The Directional Analysis of a Bloodstain Pattern Located on a Sloped Ceiling, A.L. Carter, Rachel Collins, Serge Larocque and Brian Yamashita, Abstracts of Papers Presented at the IABPA Annual Training Conference in Tucson, Arizona October 6-8, 2004, Page 12.
- Bloodstains on Fabric, The Effects of Droplet Velocity and Fabric Composition, Joseph A. Slemko, December 2003 News, Page 3-11.
- 47. Adolf, F., *The Structure of Textiles*, in *Forensic Examination of Fibres*, J. Robertson and M. Grieve, Editors. 1999, CRC Press: Boca Raton, Florida.
- 48. Karger, B., S.P. Rand, and B. Brinkmann, Experimental Bloodstains on Fabric from Contact and from Droplets. International

Journal of Legal Medicine, 1998.111(1): p. 17-21.

- Tronnberg, R., E. Silenieks, and K. Both, *The recognition of expirated bloodstain patterns on cotton fabrics*, F.S. SA, Editor 2007, Government of South Australia: Adelaide.
- 50. SA, F.S., *The recognition of expirated bloodstain patterns on fabrics*, 2007.
- 51. White, B., Bloodstain Patterns on Fabrics: The Effect of Drop Volume, Dropping Height and Impact Angle. *Journal of the Canadian Society of Forensic Science*, 1986. 19(1): p. 3-36.
- 52. *Hammer Physics*. (2013). Retrieved from Truth4Inge.com website: http://www.truth 4inge.com/Hammer_Physics_web.pdf
- Abstracts of Presentations and Workshops Given at The 2011 IABPA Annual Training Conference in Milwaukee, Wisconsin, Wound Analysis and BPA, Rex Sparks, Page 15. December News 2011.
- 54. http://karelatheredhawk.tumblr.com/post/818 27166274/fuckyeahforensics-in-1895-dreduard-piotrowski.
- 55. Abstracts Of Papers Presented At The IABPA Annual Conference in Santa Barbara, California October 5-7, 2005, Beating Patterns, Mike Barnes, Page 24.
- 56. Abstracts Of Papers Presented At The IABPA Annual Conference in Santa Barbara, California October 5-7, 2005, Bloody Fingerprint: *Fresh Blood or Not?* Peter D. Barnett D-ABC, Page 26.
- 57. Exploring the Relationship between Finger/Palm Prints and Blood, *Rob Bone*, *December News 2010, Page* 10-16.
- Huss, K., Clark, J.D. and Chisum, J. Which was First – Fingerprint or Blood? *Journal of Forensic Identification*, 334/50 (41), 2000.
- 59. http://eknygos.lsmuni.lt/springer/659/375-400.pdf.
- 60. Adair, T.W., Casting Two-Dimensional Bloody Shoe Prints from Concrete, Fabric, and Human Skin: A Review of Several Methods with Recommendations. *International Association of Bloodstain Pattern Analysts News*, 2005.21(1): p. 4-8.
- 61. Brady, T. and J. Tigmo, *Extreme Temperature Effects on Bloodstain Pattern Analysis.* International Association of

Bloodstain Pattern Analysts News, 2002.18(2): p. 3-20.

- 62. http://gsite.univ-provence.fr/gsite/Local/iusti/ dir/user-4263/documents_CPI/pdf/2013 COLSUA2.pdf.
- 63. Laber, T.L. and B.P. Epstein, Substrate Effects on the Drying Time of Human Blood. *Journal of the Canadian Society of Forensic Science*, 2001.34(4): p. 209-214.
- 64. Abstracts of Papers Presented at the Annual IABPA Training Conference in Atlantic City, New Jersey, October 5-8, 2010.
- 65. Abstracts of Presentations and Workshops Given at the 2011 IABPA Annual Training Conference in Milwaukee, Wisconsin, December News 2011, Final Voyage, Stuart H. James, Page 10.
- 66. Nour-Eldin, F. and Wilkinson, J.F., The Blood Clotting Factors in Human Saliva, *Journal of Physiology*, 136, 1957, pp. 324-332.
- 67. Berckmans, R., Sturk, A., Schaap, M.C.L. and Nieuwland, R., Cell-derived Vesicles Exposing Coagulant Tissue Factor in Saliva, Blood, *Journal of the American Society of Hematology*, On-line ISSN 1528-0020, 2011.
- 68. Doo, H.K. and Lee, P.H., Effect of Human Saliva on Blood Coagulation, *Yomsei Medical Journal*, Vol. 1, 1960, pp. 17-21.
- 69. The Directional Analysis of a Bloodstain Pattern Located on a Sloped Ceiling ,A.L. Carter, Rachel Collins, Serge Larocque and Brian Yamashita, Abstracts Of Papers presented At The IABPA Annual Conference In Tucson, Arizona October 6 -8, 2004, Page 12.
- 70. http://forident.com/research_articles/furthervalidation-of-the-backtrack-computerprogram-for-bloodstain-pattern-analysisprecision-and-accuracy/.
- 71. https://www.ncjrs.gov/App/publications/abst ract.aspx?ID=234818.
- 72. http://hemospat.com/#/0.
- 73. Carter, A. L., Bloodstain pattern analysis with a video camera and a PC computer, IABPA News, 11 (2), 1995, 15-16.
- 74. Direct Least Square Fitting of Ellipses, Andrew Fitzgibbon, Maurizio Pilu, and Robert B. Fisher, pattern analysis and

machine intelligence, vol. 21, no. 5, may 1999.

- 75. Measurements of Bloodstains using Microsoft ® Excel Autoshapes: An Accurate and Precise Bloodstain Measurement System, Sgt. Mark Reynolds, Abstracts of the Scientific Presentations given at the 2008 IABPA Annual Training Conference, Page 11-12.
- 76. Using Adobe[®] Photoshop[®] Tools for Bloodstain Documentation, Matthew Noedel, Abstracts of Papers Presented at the IABPA Annual Conference in San Antonio, Texas, Page 9.
- 77. Off at a Tangent, Michael Taylor, Abstracts of Papers Presented At the IABPA Annual Conference in Corning, New York, Page 23-24.
- Anatomy Related Movement Analysis (ARMA) – Introduction and Application to the Movements of Human Fingers, Silke M.C. Brodbeck, Abstracts Of Papers Presented At The IABPA Annual Conference In Corning, New York, October 18-20, 2006, Page 16.
- 79. Three-Dimensional Representation of Bloodstain Pattern Analysis, Detective Kevin Maloney, Abstracts Of Papers Presented At The IABPA Annual Conference in Santa Barbara, California October 5-7, 2005, Page 26.
- eSCrime 3-Dimensional Bloodstain Pattern Analysis Software, Philippe Esperanca, Abstracts Of Papers Presented At The IABPA Annual Conference in Santa Barbara, California October 5-7, 2005, Page 23.
- 81. *State of Ohio vs. Samuel H. Shepard*, in *Kirk*, *P.L*.1955, Court of Common Pleas, Criminal Branch, No. 64571. p. 1.
- 82. Kirk, P.L., *Affidavit Regarding State of Ohio* V. Samuel Sheppard, in Court of Common Pleas, Criminal Branch, No. 645711955.
- 83. Kirk, P.L., Blood A Neglected Criminalistics Research Area. *Law Enforcement Science and Technology*, 1967.22(1): p. 267-279.
- 84. Indiana v. David Camm: Comments and Concerns, Bart Epstein, Abstracts of Papers Presented At the IABPA Annual Conference in Corning, New York, Page 17.

- Akin, L.L., Interpretation of Blood Spatter for Defense Attorneys and Investigators: Part I. The Champion, 2005. 26(may).
- 86. James, S. H. (1998). Scientific and legal applications of bloodstain pattern interpretation. Boca Raton, FL: CRC Press.
- Henderson, C., Legal and Ethical Aspects of Bloodstain Pattern Evidence, in Scientific and Legal Applications of Bloodstain Pattern Interpretation, S.H. James, Editor 1998, CRC Press: Boca Raton, Fla. p. 91 - 120.
- SWGSTAIN, Scientific Working Group on Bloodstain Pattern Analysis: Topics to Consider in Preparation for an Admissibility Hearing on Bloodstain Pattern Analysis Forensic Science Communications 2008. 10(1).
- 89. Daubert *et al.* v Merrell Dow Pharmaceuticals Inc., 1993, United States Supreme Court.
- 90. Mealey, Texas Court finds Blood Spatter Pattern Analysis not helpful, *Inadmissible*. Mealey's Daubert Reports, 2000.4(2): p. 1.
- 91. Ristenbatt III, R. R. (2009). Review of: Bloodstain Pattern Analysis with an Introduction to Crime Scene Reconstruction, 3rd edition. *Journal of Forensic Sciences*, 54(1). doi:10.1111/j.1556-4029.2008. 00932.x.
- 92. Brodbeck, S. (2012). Introduction to Bloodstain Pattern Analysis. *SIAK Journal-Journal of Police Science and Practice*, 2, 51-57. doi:10.7396/IE_2012_E.
- 93. Another Confusing Bloodstain Pattern, Herbert Leon MacDonell, Abstracts of Papers Presented at the IABPA Annual Training Conference in Tucson, Arizona October 6-8, 2004, Page 10.
- 94. BPA Factors Wet Clothing Considerations, Gillian Leak, Abstracts of Papers Presented at the Annual IABPA Training Conference in Atlantic City, New Jersey, October 5-8, 2010, Page 27.
- 95. https://www.ameslab.gov/files/morrisbias.pptx.
- 96. http://www.rmabpa.org/Resources/Documen ts/SWGSTAIN%20Reference%20List%20b y%20Group%20Sept%202013.pdf.



